PATTERNS OF "BLACK ECONOMY IN MEDICINE"
UTILIZATION UNDER THE NATIONAL
HEALTH INSURANCE LAW

RONEN ROZERSLUM

2007
The Faculty of Business and Economics
Janus Pannonius University
Pécs

PATTERNS OF 'BLACK ECONOMY IN MEDICINE' UTILIZATION UNDER THE NATIONAL HEALTH INSURANCE LAW

Submitted to Professor Gyula Zeller
By Ronen Rozenblum

2007
# Table of Content

Abstract 1
Introduction 4

Chapter 1: Health system policy around the world 7
  1.1 Health policy and strategy 7
    1.1.1 The attributes of health policy 7
    1.1.2 The scope of health policy 8
    1.1.3 The content of health policy 8
    1.1.4 Health strategy 10
    1.1.5 The process of defining health strategies and policies 10
    1.1.6 International policy and health strategy 12
  1.2 Inequality and injustice in the health system –
    Approaches, strategies and international programs 13
    1.2.1 Introduction 13
    1.2.2 National strategy and plans of action 16
  1.3 The global crisis in health services 18

Chapter 2: A review of the health system in Israel 21
  2.1 The structure of the health system 21
  2.2 The crisis in the Israeli health system 22
  2.3 The reform in the health market – the National Health
    Insurance Law 24
  2.4 The mix of medical services in Israeli government
    hospitals: Public medicine, private medicine and private
    medical service in government hospitals (PMS) 29
    2.4.1 Public medicine in Israel 29
    2.4.2 Private medicine 30
    2.4.3 PMS in government hospitals 30
      2.4.3.1 Those favoring of choosing a doctor for payment 31
      2.4.3.2 Those opposing the choice of a doctor for payment 32
      2.4.3.3 The global situation 33
  2.5 Inequality and injustice in the Israeli health system 34
    2.5.1 Awareness of the extent of inequality in price and its
      importance 34
    2.5.2 The reasons for inequality in the health system 35
    2.5.3 Barriers to intervention to reduce inequality 36
    2.5.4 Coping with inequality in health: The role of the
      health system 36
    2.5.5 Interviewees' proposals for specific changes to expand
      the role of the health system in reducing inequality 36
    2.5.6 The role of professionals in the health domain 37
    2.5.7 Role holders in the government 37
Chapter 3: Black economy in medicine

3.1 Black economy: The scope of the phenomenon, its definition and its impact
   3.1.1 The scope of the phenomenon of black economy
   3.1.2 Defining the black economy
   3.1.3 The impact of the black economy

3.2 The phenomenon of black economy in medicine
   3.2.1 The connection between black economics and black economy in medicine
   3.2.2 The attributes and definitions of black economy
      In medicine
   3.2.3 Historical background
   3.2.4 Israeli legal decisions regarding black economy in medicine

3.3 Black economy in medicine and (the doctor) medicine as a 'for profit' economic unit
   3.3.1 Hospitals as economic conglomerates
   3.3.2 The connection between the doctors, the medical industry and black economy in medicine
      3.3.2.1 The results of the interaction and the implications for policy and black economy in medicine
      3.3.2.2 The connection between black economy in medicine and the medicine practiced in Israel
      3.3.2.3 The extent of black economy in medicine in Israel

Chapter 4: Marketing and consumer behavior in the health market

4.1 Marketing in the health services: the need, the cost and the value

4.2 The marketing attributes in the health market

4.3 The limitations of the marketing approach in the health services

4.4 Consumer behavior in the health market
   4.4.1 Introduction to approaches to consumer behavior
   4.4.2 Consumer involvement in the health market
   4.4.3 The health service consumer's decision-making process
   4.4.4 Consumer satisfaction with the level of service and functioning of the health service

4.5 Manufacturer' behavior in the health market – the doctors
   4.5.1 Burnout in the doctors' status
   4.5.2 The attributes of doctors' employment in Israel
   4.5.3 Overwork
   4.5.4 Satisfaction with work
   4.5.5 The level of burnout at work
4.6 Specific features of health economics

Chapter 5: The research hypotheses

5.1 Hypotheses regarding the definition of black economy in medicine

5.2 Hypotheses connected to the estimated scope of black economy in medicine

5.3 Hypothesis connected to the perceptions and attitudes towards black economy in medicine

5.4 Hypothesis connected to the attitudes of the hospital administration towards the black economy in medicine

Chapter 6: The research methodology

6.1 Introduction

6.2 The limitations of the research method

6.3 The research population

6.3.1 The doctors

6.3.2 The patients

6.3.3 Determining the sample size

6.4 The research tools

6.5 The research process

6.6 Data analysis and processing

Chapter 7: The research findings

7.1 The findings of the definition of black economy in medicine

7.1.1 Introduction

7.1.2 The doctors' definition of black economy in medicine

7.1.3 Patients' definition of black economy in medicine

7.1.4 Differences between patients and doctors in the perception of black economy in medicine

7.2 Estimate of the scope of black economy in medicine

7.2.1 Introduction

7.2.2 Estimate of the frequency of black economy in Medicine

7.2.3 Doctors' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine

7.2.4 Patients' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine

7.2.5 The doctors' perception of the degree of awareness and cooperation of the hospital administration with the phenomenon of black economy in medicine

7.3 Attitudes towards black economy in medicine

7.3.1 Introduction

7.3.2 The perception of the phenomenon of black economy in medicine amongst doctors

7.3.3 Patients' perception of black economy in medicine
Chapter 8: Discussion

8.1 Discussion of the definition of black economy in medicine

8.1.1 The degree of agreement of the doctors with the
dimensions of the definitions of black
economy in medicine

8.1.2 The degree of agreement of the doctor population
with the dimensions of black economy in medicine
according to professional background variables

8.1.3 The degree of agreement of the doctor population with
the dimensions of the definitions of black
economy in medicine according to the degree of doctors'
satisfaction with their work and salaries

8.1.4 The extent of agreement by patients with
the dimensions of the definitions of black economy
in medicine

8.1.5 The degree of the patients' agreement with the
dimensions of the definitions of black economy in
medicine according to background variables

8.1.6 The degree of agreement of the patient and the
doctor population with the dimensions of the
definitions of black economy in medicine

8.2 Discussion of the estimate of the scope of black
economy in medicine

8.2.1 Evaluation of the doctors' perception of the scope of
black economy in medicine

8.2.2 Evaluation of the doctors' perception of the scope of
black economy in medicine according to dimensions of the
diverse definitions of black economy in medicine

8.2.3 Estimate of the doctors' perception of the scope of
black economy in medicine according to
background variables

8.2.4 Estimate of the patients' perception of the scope of
black economy in medicine

8.2.5 Estimate of the patients' perception of the scope of
black economy in medicine according to the dimensions of
the diverse definitions of black economy in medicine

8.2.6 Estimate of the patients' perception of the scope of
black economy in medicine according to
background variables

8.2.7 Satisfaction of the patients with the medical treatment
and the connection to the scope of the black
economy in medicine phenomenon
8.3 Discussion of the attitudes towards black economy in medicine 158
8.4 Discussion of the attitudes of the hospital administrations towards the black economy in medicine phenomenon 162
Chapter 9: Summary and recommendations 164
9.1 Summary of the main research findings 165
9.2 Recommendations for future directions of activity for reducing the dimensions of the black economy in medicine phenomenon 171
9.2.1 Recruitment for action 172
9.3 Possible directions for concrete change in health system 174
Policy and intervention programs in the field 175
9.4 Questions and recommendations for further study 177
Bibliography 177
Appendices: 186
Appendix A: Research questionnaire – Patients 186
Appendix B: Research questionnaire – Doctors 191

List of figures

Figure no. 1: The administrative process for developing national health (Cohen, 1990) 11
Figure no. 2: The reciprocal relations regarding equality in the health system (Berg, Rosen and Morgenstern, 2002) 15

List of charts

Chart no. 1: Summary of the changes in health policy following ratification of the law 28

List of tables

Table no. 1: Gross national product (%) in selected countries 18
Table no. 2: Demographic attributes of the doctors' sample (N=200) 85
Table no. 3: Demographic attributes of the patient sample (N=200) 88
Table no. 4: Definition of black economy in medicine by doctors 96
Table no. 5: Values for the Chi square test for diverse combinations of descriptions of black economy in medicine compared to variables of the professional background amongst doctors 101
Table no. 6: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to hospital seniority 102
Table no. 7: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to doctors' medical seniority 103
Table no. 8: The perception of the definition of black economy in medicine according to tenure 104
Table no. 9: The perception of the definition of black economy in medicine according to position 105
Table no. 10: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to department 106
Table no. 11: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to hospital 107
Table no. 12: Values of the Chi square test for diverse combinations of descriptions of black economy in medicine compared to variables of the demographic background amongst doctors 108
Table no. 13: Values for Chi square test for diverse combinations of descriptions of black economy in medicine relative to the doctors' background variables 109
Table no. 14: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to the economic situation 110
Table no. 15: Perceptions of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to satisfaction with the salary 111
Table no. 16: Patient definitions of black economy in medicine 112
Table no. 17: Values for the Chi square test for diverse combinations of doctors' descriptions of black economy in medicine compared to background variables amongst patients 114
Table no. 18: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to patient gender 115
Table no. 19: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to patients' economic situation 116
Table no. 20: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to patient hospitalization 117
Table no. 21: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to the perception of the waiting time for an operation 117
Table no. 22: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to satisfaction with the medical treatment 118
Table no. 23: The percentage of doctors reporting that the diverse definitions express very well the phenomenon of black economy in medicine as compared to patients 119
Table no. 24: The number of definitions that express black economy in medicine very well amongst doctors compared to patients 120
Table no. 25: Doctors' and patients' assessment of the frequency of black economy in medicine

Table no. 26: Doctors' and patients' assessment of the change in the scope of black economy in medicine after the ratification of the National Health Service Law

Table no. 27: Doctors' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine

Table no. 28: Values of the Chi square test for the doctors' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine according to hospital and department specialty

Table no. 29: Activities associated with black economy in medicine in the patient's surroundings

Table no. 30: Chi square test values for reporting on black economy in medicine activities in the patients' environment

Table no. 31: Activities connected with black economy in medicine in the patients' environment

Table no. 32: Values for the Chi square test for performing various actions linked to black economy in medicine compared to patients' background variables

Table no. 33: Report on performance of black economy in medicine activities according to age

Table no. 34: Report on performing black economy in medicine activities according to economic situation

Table no. 35: Report on black economy in medicine activities according to hospital

Table no. 36: Reporting on black economy in medicine activities according to age

Table no. 37: The doctors' perception of the attitude of the hospital administration to the phenomenon of black economy in medicine

Table no. 38: The doctors' perception of the positive and negative aspects of black economy in medicine

Table no. 39: The doctors' perception of black economy in medicine ethics

Table no. 40: The patients' perception of the positive and negative aspects of black economy in medicine

Table no. 41: The patients' perception of the ethics of black economy in medicine