

UNIVERSITY OF PECS
FACULTY OF BUSINESS AND ECONOMY

PATTERNS OF 'BLACK ECONOMY IN MEDICINE'
UTILIZATION UNDER THE NATIONAL
HEALTH INSURANCE LAW

RONEN ROZENBLUM

2007

The Faculty of Business and Economics

Janus Pannonius University

Pécs

**PATTERNS OF 'BLACK ECONOMY IN
MEDICINE' UTILIZATION UNDER THE
NATIONAL HEALTH INSURANCE LAW**

Submitted to Professor Gyula Zeller

By Ronen Rozenblum

2007

Table of Content

| | |
|--|----|
| Abstract | 1 |
| Introduction | 4 |
| Chapter 1: Health system policy around the world | 7 |
| 1.1 Health policy and strategy | 7 |
| 1.1.1 The attributes of health policy | 7 |
| 1.1.2 The scope of health policy | 8 |
| 1.1.3 The content of health policy | 8 |
| 1.1.4 Health strategy | 10 |
| 1.1.5 The process of defining health strategies and policies | 10 |
| 1.1.6 International policy and health strategy | 12 |
| 1.2 Inequality and injustice in the health system – Approaches, strategies and international programs | 13 |
| 1.2.1 Introduction | 13 |
| 1.2.2 National strategy and plans of action | 16 |
| 1.3 The global crisis in health services | 18 |
| Chapter 2: A review of the health system in Israel | 21 |
| 2.1 The structure of the health system | 21 |
| 2.2 The crisis in the Israeli health system | 22 |
| 2.3 The reform in the health market – the National Health Insurance Law | 24 |
| 2.4 The mix of medical services in Israeli government hospitals: Public medicine, private medicine and private medical service in government hospitals (PMS) | 29 |
| 2.4.1 Public medicine in Israel | 29 |
| 2.4.2 Private medicine | 30 |
| 2.4.3 PMS in government hospitals | 30 |
| 2.4.3.1 Those favoring of choosing a doctor for payment | 31 |
| 2.4.3.2 Those opposing the choice of a doctor for payment | 32 |
| 2.4.3.3 The global situation | 33 |
| 2.5 Inequality and injustice in the Israeli health system | 34 |
| 2.5.1 Awareness of the extent of inequality in price and its importance | 34 |
| 2.5.2 The reasons for inequality in the health system | 35 |
| 2.5.3 Barriers to intervention to reduce inequality | 36 |
| 2.5.4 Coping with inequality in health: The role of the health system | 36 |
| 2.5.5 Interviewees' proposals for specific changes to expand the role of the health system in reducing inequality | 36 |
| 2.5.6 The role of professionals in the health domain | 37 |
| 2.5.7 Role holders in the government | 37 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Chapter 3: Black economy in medicine | 38 |
| 3.1 Black economy: The scope of the phenomenon, its definition and its impact | 38 |
| 3.1.1 The scope of the phenomenon of black economy | 39 |
| 3.1.2 Defining the black economy | 39 |
| 3.1.3 The impact of the black economy | 42 |
| 3.2 The phenomenon of black economy in medicine | 44 |
| 3.2.1 The connection between black economics and black economy in medicine | 45 |
| 3.2.2 The attributes and definitions of black economy In medicine | 47 |
| 3.2.3 Historical background | 48 |
| 3.2.4 Israeli legal decisions regarding black economy in medicine | 51 |
| 3.3 Black economy in medicine and (the doctor) medicine as a 'for profit' economic unit | 52 |
| 3.3.1 Hospitals as economic conglomerates | 53 |
| 3.3.2 The connection between the doctors, the medical industry and black economy in medicine | 54 |
| 3.3.2.1 The results of the interaction and the implications for policy and black economy in medicine | 55 |
| 3.3.2.2 The connection between black economy in medicine and the medicine practiced in Israel | 56 |
| 3.3.2.3 The extent of black economy in medicine in Israel | 57 |
| Chapter 4: Marketing and consumer behavior in the health market | 59 |
| 4.1 Marketing in the health services: the need, the cost and the value | 59 |
| 4.2 The marketing attributes in the health market | 61 |
| 4.3 The limitations of the marketing approach in the health services | 63 |
| 4.4 Consumer behavior in the health market | 64 |
| 4.4.1 Introduction to approaches to consumer behavior | 65 |
| 4.4.2 Consumer involvement in the health market | 68 |
| 4.4.3 The health service consumer's decision-making process | 68 |
| 4.4.4 Consumer satisfaction with the level of service and functioning of the health service | 71 |
| 4.5 Manufacturer' behavior in the health market – the doctors | 73 |
| 4.5.1 Burnout in the doctors' status | 74 |
| 4.5.2 The attributes of doctors' employment in Israel | 75 |
| 4.5.3 Overwork | 75 |
| 4.5.4 Satisfaction with work | 76 |
| 4.5.5 The level of burnout at work | 76 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 4.6 Specific features of health economics | 77 |
| Chapter 5: The research hypotheses | 79 |
| 5.1 Hypotheses regarding the definition of black economy in medicine | 79 |
| 5.2 Hypotheses connected to the estimated scope of black economy in medicine | 80 |
| 5.3 Hypothesis connected to the perceptions and attitudes towards black economy in medicine | 80 |
| 5.4 Hypothesis connected to the attitudes of the hospital administration towards the black economy in medicine | 80 |
| Chapter 6: The research methodology | 81 |
| 6.1 Introduction | 81 |
| 6.2 The limitations of the research method | 82 |
| 6.3 The research population | 83 |
| 6.3.1 The doctors | 83 |
| 6.3.2 The patients | 86 |
| 6.3.3 Determining the sample size | 88 |
| 6.4 The research tools | 90 |
| 6.5 The research process | 92 |
| 6.6 Data analysis and processing | 93 |
| Chapter 7: The research findings | 94 |
| 7.1 The findings of the definition of black economy in medicine | 94 |
| 7.1.1 Introduction | 94 |
| 7.1.2 The doctors' definition of black economy in medicine | 96 |
| 7.1.3 Patients' definition of black economy in medicine | 111 |
| 7.1.4 Differences between patients and doctors in the perception of black economy in medicine | 119 |
| 7.2 Estimate of the scope of black economy in medicine | 120 |
| 7.2.1 Introduction | 120 |
| 7.2.2 Estimate of the frequency of black economy in Medicine | 121 |
| 7.2.3 Doctors' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine | 122 |
| 7.2.4 Patients' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine | 125 |
| 7.2.5 The doctors' perception of the degree of awareness and cooperation of the hospital administration with the phenomenon of black economy in medicine | 130 |
| 7.3 Attitudes towards black economy in medicine | 131 |
| 7.3.1 Introduction | 131 |
| 7.3.2 The perception of the phenomenon of black economy in medicine amongst doctors | 132 |
| 7.3.3 Patients' perception of black economy in medicine | 134 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 8: Discussion | 136 |
| 8.1 Discussion of the definition of black economy in medicine | 136 |
| 8.1.1 The degree of agreement of the doctors with the Dimensions of the definitions of black economy in medicine | 136 |
| 8.1.2 The degree of agreement of the doctor population With the dimensions of black economy in medicine according to professional background variables | 138 |
| 8.1.3 The degree of agreement of the doctor population with the dimensions of the definitions of the black economy in medicine according to the degree of doctors' satisfaction with their work and salaries | 139 |
| 8.1.4 The extent of agreement by patients with the dimensions of the definitions of black economy in medicine | 141 |
| 8.1.5 The degree of the patients' agreement with the dimensions of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to background variables | 144 |
| 8.1.6 The degree of agreement of the patient and the doctor population with the dimensions of the definitions of black economy in medicine | 146 |
| 8.2 Discussion of the estimate of the scope of black economy in medicine | 147 |
| 8.2.1 Evaluation of the doctors' perception of the scope of black economy in medicine | 148 |
| 8.2.2 Evaluation of the doctors' perception of the scope of black economy in medicine according to dimensions of the diverse definitions of black economy in medicine | 150 |
| 8.2.3 Estimate of the doctors' perception of the scope of black economy in medicine according to background variables | 152 |
| 8.2.4 Estimate of the patients' perception of the scope of black economy in medicine | 152 |
| 8.2.5 Estimate of the patients' perception of the scope of black economy in medicine according to the dimensions of the diverse definitions of black economy in medicine | 154 |
| 8.2.6 Estimate of the patients' perception of the scope of black economy in medicine according to background variables | 155 |
| 8.2.7 Satisfaction of the patients with the medical treatment and the connection to the scope of the black economy in medicine phenomenon | 157 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 8.3 Discussion of the attitudes towards black economy in medicine | 158 |
| 8.4 Discussion of the attitudes of the hospital administrations towards the black economy in medicine phenomenon | 162 |
| Chapter 9: Summary and recommendations | 164 |
| 9.1 Summary of the main research findings | 165 |
| 9.2 Recommendations for future directions of activity for reducing the dimensions of the black economy in medicine phenomenon | 171 |
| 9.2.1 Recruitment for action | 172 |
| 9.3 Possible directions for concrete change in health system | |
| Policy and intervention programs in the field | 174 |
| 9.4 Questions and recommendations for further study | 175 |
| Bibliography | 177 |
| Appendices: | 186 |
| Appendix A: Research questionnaire – Patients | 186 |
| Appendix B: Research questionnaire – Doctors | 191 |

List of figures

| | |
|--|----|
| Figure no. 1: The administrative process for developing national health (Cohen, 1990) | 11 |
| Figure no. 2: The reciprocal relations regarding equality in the health system (Berg, Rosen and Morgenstern, 2002) | 15 |

List of charts

| | |
|--|----|
| Chart no. 1: Summary of the changes in health policy following ratification of the law | 28 |
|--|----|

List of tables

| | |
|--|-----|
| Table no. 1: Gross national product (%) in selected countries | 18 |
| Table no. 2: Demographic attributes of the doctors' sample (N=200) | 85 |
| Table no. 3: Demographic attributes of the patient sample (N=200) | 88 |
| Table no. 4: Definition of black economy in medicine by doctors | 96 |
| Table no. 5: Values for the Chi square test for diverse combinations of descriptions of black economy in medicine compared to variables of the professional background amongst doctors | 101 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table no. 6: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to hospital seniority | 102 |
| Table no. 7: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to doctors' medical seniority | 103 |
| Table no. 8: The perception of the definition of black economy in medicine according to tenure | 104 |
| Table no. 9: The perception of the definition of black economy in medicine according to position | 105 |
| Table no. 10: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to department | 106 |
| Table no. 11: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to hospital | 107 |
| Table no. 12: Values of the Chi square test for diverse combinations of descriptions of black economy in medicine compared to variables of the demographic background amongst doctors | 108 |
| Table no. 13: Values for Chi square test for diverse combinations of descriptions of black economy in medicine relative to the doctors' background variables | 109 |
| Table no. 14: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to the economic situation | 110 |
| Table no. 15: Perceptions of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to satisfaction with the salary | 111 |
| Table no. 16: Patient definitions of black economy in medicine | 112 |
| Table no. 17: Values for the Chi square test for diverse combinations of doctors' descriptions of black economy in medicine compared to background variables amongst patients | 114 |
| Table no. 18: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to patient gender | 115 |
| Table no. 19: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to patients' economic situation | 116 |
| Table no. 20: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to patient hospitalization | 117 |
| Table no. 21: Perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to the perception of the waiting time for an operation | 117 |
| Table no. 22: The perception of the definitions of black economy in medicine according to satisfaction with the medical treatment | 118 |
| Table no. 23: The percentage of doctors reporting that the diverse definitions express very well the phenomenon of black economy in medicine as compared to patients | 119 |
| Table no. 24: The number of definitions that express black economy in medicine very well amongst doctors compared to patients | 120 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Table no. 25: Doctors' and patients' assessment of the frequency of black economy in medicine | 121 |
| Table no. 26: Doctors' and patients' assessment of the change in the scope of black economy in medicine after the ratification of the National Health Service Law | 122 |
| Table no. 27: Doctors' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine | 123 |
| Table no. 28: Values of the Chi square test for the doctors' assessment of the scope of black economy in medicine according to hospital and department specialty | 124 |
| Table no. 29: Activities associated with black economy in medicine in the patient's surroundings | 126 |
| Table no. 30: Chi square test values for reporting on black economy in medicine activities in the patients' environment | 126 |
| Table no. 31: Activities connected with black economy in medicine in the patients' environment | 128 |
| Table no. 32: Values for the Chi square test for performing various actions linked to black economy in medicine compared to patients' background variables | 128 |
| Table no. 33: Report on performance of black economy in medicine activities according to age | 129 |
| Table no. 34: Report on performing black economy in medicine activities according to economic situation | 129 |
| Table no. 35: Report on black economy in medicine activities according to hospital | 130 |
| Table no. 36: Reporting on black economy in medicine activities according to age | 130 |
| Table no. 37: The doctors' perception of the attitude of the hospital administration to the phenomenon of black economy in medicine | 131 |
| Table no. 38: The doctors' perception of the positive and negative aspects of black economy in medicine | 133 |
| Table no. 39: The doctors' perception of black economy in medicine ethics | 133 |
| Table no. 40: The patients' perception of the positive and negative aspects of black economy in medicine | 134 |
| Table no. 41: The patients' perception of the ethics of black economy in medicine | 135 |